Environmental Protection Agency Region III
Office of Municipal Assistance (3WP24)
1650 Arch Street
Philadelphia, PA 19103-2029

NPDES No. PA0027111
Public Notice Number: PA-299 JML

Dear Mr. Lovell,

The following comments are submitted by N.A. Water Systems on the behalf of Keystone Rustproofing. These comments are offered in regards to the modifications of the pretreatment program for the Municipal Sanitary Authority of the City of New Kensington (MSANK), 120 Logans Ferry Road, New Kensington, Pennsylvania 15068-2046. Keystone Rustproofing is an industrial user within the MSANK jurisdiction.

1. In the Attachments included with the March 2005 submittal to the EPA, the activated sludge inhibition criteria for silver is stated as 0.25 mg/L. This value is not included in Appendix G of the July 2004 EPA document titled *Local Limits Development Guidance Appendices*. All the other inhibition values listed come from Appendix G. The inhibition value for silver ends up being the controlling factor when calculating the local limit for silver. The silver inhibition value used appears to come from a source other than the EPA document. We are requesting to know the source of the silver inhibition value. There may be a need for the silver local limit to be re-evaluated.

2. The March 2005 submittal to the EPA indicates the desire for the Authority to adopt three sets of local limits based on 1) no sludge criteria, 2) non-exceptional quality sludge criteria, and 3) exceptional sludge criteria. The sludge criteria is the controlling factor for determining the local limits for arsenic, cadmium, copper, lead, mercury, molybdenum, nickel, selenium, and zinc. The local limits for arsenic, cadmium, copper, lead, nickel and zinc decreased significantly from the previously approved local limits. Below is a table comparing the current sludge concentrations in the MSANK treatment plant sludge sampled for the local limits evaluation and the corresponding Federal exceptional quality sludge criteria:

Pollutant	Average MSANK Sludge Concentration	Federal Exceptional Sludge Quality

	(mg/kg)	Criteria (mg/kg)
Arsenic	4.34	41
Cadmium	14.1	39
Copper	858	1500
Lead	203	300
Mercury	1.60	17
Molybdenum	15.3	75
Nickel	193	420
Selenium	5.29	100
Zinc	2,780	2,800

As the table above shows, the current sludge concentrations at the plant, based on the previously approved local limits, are below the Federal exceptional quality sludge criteria. The previously approved local limits (pre-2006) are already protective of the Authority's desire to produce exceptional quality sludge in the future.

Additionally, the proposed local limits for cadmium, copper, lead, nickel, silver, zinc and total cyanide are below the corresponding monthly average limits for the 40 CFR 433 Metal Finishing New Source category. The March 2005 submittal to the EPA is proposing the following local limits for cadmium, copper, lead, nickel, silver, zinc and total cyanide.

Pollutant	Pre-2006 Local Limits (mg/L)	Local Limits Requested for 2008-2015 (mg/L)	40 CFR 433 - PSNS Monthly Average Limit (mg/l)
Cadmium	0.2	0.028	0.07
Copper	3.4	0.6	2.07
Lead	2.31	0.16	0.43
Nickel	1.68	0.454	2.38
Silver	1.38	0.56	0.24
Zinc	34.7	1.56	1.48
Cyanide (Total)	0.15	0.15	0.65

According to Page 6-13 of the July 2004 EPA document titled *Local Limits Development Guidance*, local limits should pass a "common sense test". One of the tests is "Are the limits technologically achievable?" This test asks if industrial users are likely to meet the proposed local limits with currently available forms of pretreatment and pollution prevention? The 40 CFR 433 limitations are based upon the Best Available Technology (BAT) economically achievable for the metal finishing industry. It should be noted that Keystone Rustproofing is categorized as a 40 CFR 413 Electroplater with a flow greater than 10,000 gallons per day. The 40 CFR 433 discharge limitations and BAT requirements are more stringent than the 40 CFR 413 discharge limitations and BAT requirements.

The fact that the proposed local limits are below what the EPA has deemed "technologically and economically achievable" under 40 CFR 433 is an indication that industrial users are not likely to meet the proposed local limits. As a result, the proposed local limits for cadmium, copper, lead, nickel, silver, zinc and total cyanide do not meet the test of being technologically achievable.

We are requesting that the proposed local limits for arsenic, cadmium, copper, lead, mercury, molybdenum, nickel, selenium and zinc be re-evaluated since the pre-2006 local limits for these constituents are leading to existing MSANK sludge concentrations below the Federal exceptional quality sludge criteria. The proposed local limits for cadmium, copper, lead, nickel, silver, zinc, and total cyanide should also be re-evaluated since the proposed limits for these constituents may not be technologically achievable.

If you have any questions or comments concerning the contents of this letter, please contact Brian Shoener of N.A. Water Systems at (734) 973-0700.

Respectfully submitted,

Brian G. Shoener, P.E.
Project Manager
N.A. Water Systems

cc: Joseph Ditty (MSANK)
Carl Bender (N.A. WS)